

Committee(s): Digital Services Committee	Dated: 13 th May 2024
Subject: Device Refresh	Public
Which outcomes in the City Corporation's Corporate Plan does this proposal aim to impact directly?	8, 9, 10, 11
Does this proposal require extra revenue and/or capital spending?	No
If so, how much?	N/A
What is the source of Funding?	£125k Members Refresh £0.75m COL Capital Programme £1.2m COLP Capital Programme 24/25 £0.4m COLP Capital Programme 25/26 Barbican & GSMD Capital Fund Schools – Annual Refresh
Has this Funding Source been agreed with the Chamberlain's Department?	No
Report of: Caroline Al-Beyerty, Chamberlain	For Decision
Report author: Zakki Ghauri, Director of Digital & IT	

Summary

This document provides a summary of future device purchasing for the City of London (COL) organisations including the City of London Corporation and all the City of London Institutions. It is intended to be adhered to for future device purchasing from Q1 2024 onwards.

It is intended to unify the vendor and model(s) of hardware deployed across the City of London organisations to streamline support models, hardware reuse and swap outs, warranty processing and provide a commercial economy of scale during the purchasing cycles.

Recommendation(s)

Members are asked to agree the move from a mixed estate of five different vendors to a single vendor for the wider Corporation – including Institutions.

Main Report

Background

1. The City of London Corporation and Police (COLP) currently deploy Microsoft Surface laptops across their estates and were refreshed during 2019 and early 2020. City of London School and School for Girls (COLSfG) currently utilise Dell, Freemans school utilise HP's and Lenovo, and the Barbican deploy Lenovo and have various device ages across the fleets. We also have Viglen desktops at COL.
2. CoL and CoLP purchased devices to reflect the market conditions at the time, including a fragile and extremely constrained supply chain situation during the mass shift to home working and bulk purchasing of laptops and accessories to support every organisation workforce. CoLS, CoLSfG and Barbican have deployed devices based on commercial proposition and vendor support proposition.
3. Most of the CoL and CoLP device estate is now out of warranty and cannot be extended. In addition, over 50% of the devices in the estate will become end of life via forces obsolescence on 29th February 2024. When a device becomes end of life, it will cease to receive any further critical firmware updates which are often linked to faults with the device, or more critically security vulnerabilities. CoL will be required to carry the risk of against these devices until the refresh has completed.

Current Position

4. Over the last 4 years the workforce has experienced an increased adoption of digital services across all part of the organisation. With this increased adoption, demands on the physical devices have also increased and users require more processing power in both memory, CPU and in some case storage.
5. CoL will increase its baseline specifications from 8GB to 16GB as a standard, and will adopt the latest processor technology available, including AMD chips rather than Intel where practical. The minimum hard drive size will become 256gb and must include the fastest storage available (NVMe).
6. Whilst CoL has experienced rapid growth in digital adoption, this has been hindered by the extremely poor hardware performance of some devices, specifically the Surface Pro 7 variant. DITS conducted a lengthy survey of root cause and arrived at a working assumption that the primary issue was thermal throttling of the CPU – a simple test of running a handheld fan next to the device afforded vast improvements. This assumption was then escalated within Microsoft who confirmed in writing that the Surface Pro 7 devices have an unfixable manufacturing defect where the GPU (Graphic Processing Unit) and CPU (Central Processing Unit) are installed in close proximity to each other. The CPU already runs very hot due to passive cooling only (i.e no internal fans) and invokes a thermal throttle to protect itself from overheating, at which point when a user attempts to conduct a team's video call, the GPU comes online and

increases the heat dissipation, further causing the device to thermal throttle and “choke” the performance of the device to an unusable speed. There is no resolution to this issue other than a replacement device. The Surface Pro 7 devices will all become end of life on 29th February 2024 and will be the immediate focus for device refresh rollouts.

Current Device Estate

*correct as of Q1 2024

Device	CoL	CoLP	LC	Barbican	CLS	CLSG
Surface Pro 7	1200	643				
Surface Pro 7 +	203	184				
Surface Pro 9		121				
Surface Go 2	71	381				
Surface Laptop 3	0	524				
Surface Laptop 4	773	26				
Surface Laptop 5		43	168			
Surface Laptop Studio	0	2				
Surface Book 3		1				
Lenovo Laptops				700		
Dell Optiplex 5050			6		9	
Dell Inspiron 16 7620 2-in-1					5	
Dell Latitude 5330						33
Dell Latitude 3190 2-in-1						1
Dell Latitude 5340						104
Dell Latitude 5540						1
Dell Latitude 7420						1
Dell Latitude 7430						1
Dell Latitude 7440						2
Dell Latitude 3420					179	
Dell Latitude 3440					26	
Dell Latitude 3490					22	
Dell Latitude 5289					10	
Dell Latitude 5290					1	
Dell Latitude 5320					532	
Dell Latitude 5330					4	
Dell Latitude 5340					55	
Dell Latitude 5540					9	
Dell Latitude 5580					2	
Dell Latitude 7340					1	
Dell Latitude 7390 2-in-1					83	
Dell Latitude 7400 2-in-1					44	
Dell Latitude 7410					7	
Dell Latitude 7430					13	
Dell Latitude 7430					33	
Dell Latitude 9410					11	
Dell Latitude 9420					14	
Dell Latitude E5450					38	
Dell Optiplex 5250					48	
Dell Optiplex 5270					13	
Dell Optiplex 7040					7	
Dell Optiplex 7410					30	
Totals	2247	1925	174	700	1196	143

6385

Future Device Requirements & Styles

7. CoL conducted 2 workshops on 13th Jan 2024 and 20th Feb 2024. The first workshop included representatives from across all institutions and various roles within each organisation. XMA (our incumbent supplier of devices) arranged for HP, Microsoft and Lenovo to present the current device propositions. Dell emailed XMA to declare that they did not wish to participate in the selection process.
8. The 2nd workshop was an internal only session focussed on agreeing a single vendor across organisations or a reduction in the options.
9. Based on high level costs, Microsoft removed from the potential device brands as the baseline laptops were approved double the cost of the nearest equivalent HP or Lenovo devices.
10. There was further discussion around previous history with brands, cost, value, support and warranty.
11. The session ended with a decision to formalise the cost model and high-level points of different for each brand which are included in this document.
12. It is recommended that CoL standardise on a standard set of device types, the being:
 - a. Clamshell Laptop – 16GB / 256GB / i5
 - b. Clamshell Laptop – 16GB / 256GB / i7
 - c. Convertible Laptop – 16GB / 256GB / i5
 - d. Desktop PC – 8GB / 128GB / i5
 - e. 3 Year Next Day Warranty
13. For use cases outside of the standard devices listed above, institutions should purchase the same brand selected across the estate specifically for the users with those specialist requirements.

Vendor Proposals

14. The selected ranges from the vendors have been proposed as below – these are both premium device ranges that are direct comparisons for standing in the marketplace. Whilst other models are available from both vendors, switching one brand to another range would require the same for the other to ensure comparisons with like for like ranges.

HP

- a. HP Elitebook 800 Series
- b. HP Elitebook 1000 Series

Lenovo

- c. Lenovo Thinkpad X13
- d. Lenovo Thinkpad X1

Weight

15. The unique locations of CoL schools, offices and spaces demand that the workforce is provided with lightest devices available to support significant commutes.

Weights	HP	Lenovo
Clamshell Laptop	1.26kg	1.29kg
Convertible Laptop	1.30kg	1.38kg

16. Comparing equivalent from the HP and Lenovo ranges, HP are the lightest for the users.

Manageability

17. Both Lenovo and HP are very similar in terms of manageability, however HP's InTune plugin has no equivalent Lenovo connector making HP management easier and cheaper. Managed by InTune for OS and drivers

Warranty

18. Both providers have premium optional warranty products. HP is significantly cheaper and offer an onsite anywhere.

Battery

19. The HP batteries are larger, have a longer battery charge cycle and have a 3yr vs. 1yr warranty.

Costs

20. There is an estimated £800,000+ saving between equivalent devices from Lenovo and HP (including docking, warranty, device cost).

21. XMA can buy back old equipment and utilise this as a credit against future device purchases. The value of this is unknown until we provide an audit to them of current devices.

22. Further details of costs are in Appendix 1

Funding

23. There is £125k in Members Refresh Budget

24. A report requesting £0.75m for ongoing replenishment of Corporate Devices as and when they go out of support is going to Digital Services Committee 13 May.

25. The City of London Police's (CoLP) capital programme includes a provision of £1.6m to replace Surface Pro and Laptop devices which are coming to their end of life (2024/25: £1.2m and 2025/26: £400k).

26. This will be funded directly from the Force's £5m direct revenue financing provision or, if necessary, via the City Corporation £5m per annum loan facility.
27. The progression of this project will be subject to further business case development and approvals through CoLP's internal governance processes.
28. For schools these will be part of the normal refresh cycle and has been budgeted for every year. They will not replace all the device at once, but will do as they come out of the 5 year warranty.
29. Pupil devices will be charged to parents.
30. Institutions Barbican and GSMD have confirmed funding is available.

Corporate & Strategic Implications

31. Strategic implications – The cross-cutting nature of this work means that we will be able to provide a consistent experience for colleagues, no matter which part of the organisation they sit in
32. Financial implications – There are significant benefits of jointly procuring, including cost avoidance.
33. Resource implications – None arising from this report.
34. Legal implications – None.
35. Risk implications – None arising from this update report. Our Departmental risks are captured and managed per the Corporation's framework.
36. Equalities implications – HP is committed to sustainability and creating social value through its products and practices.
37. Climate implications - HP ensures environmental responsibility by achieving EPEAT Gold, Energy Star, and TCO 8.0 certifications, reflecting its dedication to reducing environmental impact and promoting energy efficiency. HP is the sole manufacturer on the Carbon Disclosure Project (CDP) to maintain an A rating for four consecutive years. HP uses sustainable materials in its products, driving the adoption of circular economy principles and minimising resource depletion.
38. Security implications – None arising from this report.

Conclusion

39. The move to a single vendor for our devices across the wider organisation has a number of benefits for the organisation, including financial benefits, and the ability to provide our colleagues with a consistent experience, no matter which part of the organisation they sit in.

Appendices

Appendix 1 – Cost Comparison

Zakki Ghauri

Director of Digital & IT

zakki.ghauri@cityoflondon.gov.uk

Appendix 1 – Cost Comparison

Specification Requirement	HP Offering	HP Price	Qty	Total Cost	Lenovo Offering	Lenovo Price	Qty	Total Cost
Clamshell, 16GB, 256GB, i5 or equivalent (latest generation) – portable and larger screen options	Premium Range- HP EliteBook 840 G10,i5-1335U, 16GB 256 SSD, IR CAMERA (intel available)	£631.55	4548	£2,872,291.59	Premium Range- X13 i5 Processor, 16GB 256 SSD, IR CAMERA	£664.49	4548	£3,022,122.56
Clamshell, 16GB, 256GB, i7 or equivalent (latest generation) – portable and larger screen options	Premium Range- HP EliteBook 840 G10 ,i7-1355U, 16GB 256 SSD(intel available)	£725.52	468	£339,542.67	Premium Range- X13 i5 Processor, 16GB 256 SSD, IR CAMERA	£793.81	468	£412,094.53
Convertible/Tablet, 16GB, 256GB, i5 or equivalent (latest generation) – portable and larger screen options	Premium Range- HP Elite x360 830 G10, I5-1335U 16GB 256SSD,IR CAMERA	£723.41	568	£410,895.18	Premium Range- X13 YOGA i5 Processor, 16GB 256 SSD, IR CAMERA	£1,190.60	568	£676,257.99
Desktop PC – 8GB, 128GB, i5 or equivalent (latest generation)	HP Pro SFF 400 G9, I5-13500 8GB 256 SSD	£433.80	300	£130,140.75	M75 S AMD, R5 PRO 5650G 8GB, 256 SSD (intel available)	£451.96	300	£135,587.63
USB C Docking Stations	HP USBC Dock, compatible with all proposed devices	£86.73	2842	£246,477.49	THINKPAD UNIVERSAL USB C DOCK	£127.94	2842	£363,600.21
Warranty 1 year	Included in device base cost	—			1 Year Depot	£4.03	5684	£22,915.49

Warranty 3 year	HP 3 year Next Business Day Response Onsite anywhere 800 series only (see price file for more options)	£53.00	5684	£301,252.00	3 Year Onsite X13	£83.75	5684	£476,035.00	
Total				£4,300,599.67	Total				£5,108,613.40